REFERENCES

Adhabi, E., & Anozie, C. B. (2017). Literature review for the type of interview in qualitative research. *International Journal of Education*, *9*(3), 86–97.

Artini, L., & Padmadewi, N. N. (2018). *Collaboration in EFL Classes: Listening to Teachers' and Students' Voices*. *173*(Icei 2017), 1–4. https://doi.org/10.2991/icei-17.2018.49

Barak, M., & Yuan, S. (2021). A cultural perspective to project-based learning and the cultivation of innovative thinking. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, *39*, 100766.

Barker, S. K. (2018). *Student Voice to Improve Instruction: Leading Transformation of Student Voice to Improve Instruction: Leading Transformation of a School System a School System*. 1–197. https://digitalcommons.acu.edu/etd

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *3*(2), 77–101.

Coulson, D. (2005). Collaborative tasks for cross-cultural communication. In *Teachers exploring tasks in English language teaching* (pp. 127–138). Springer.

Davila, S. (2016). 21st century skills and the English language classroom. *Retrieved November*, *2*, 2018.

De Bono, E. (1995). Serious creativity. *The Journal for Quality and Participation*, *18*(5), 12.

Desyarti Safarini, T. L. S. (2019). Developing students' collaboration skills through project-based learning in statistics. *Journal of*

Physics: Conference Series, *1265*(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1265/1/012011

Erdoğan, V. (2019). Integrating 4C skills of 21st century into 4 language skills in EFL classes. *International Journal of Education and Research*, *7*(11), 113–124.

Hales, D. (2010). An introduction to triangulation. *Geneva: UNAIDS Monitoring and Education Division*, 13–17.

Haniah, A. U., & Setyaningsih, E. (2021). Students' Perception on the Implementation of Online Project-Based Learning in Teaching 4Cs. *Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, *6*(1), 123–140.

Hennessey, B. A., & Watson, M. W. (2016). The defragmentation of creativity: future directions with an emphasis on educational applications. *Multidisciplinary Contributions to the Science of Creative Thinking*, 21–31.

Honorene, J. (2017). Understanding the role of triangulation in research. *Scholarly Research Journal for Interdisciplinary Studies*, *4*(31), 91–95.

Huriyah, L., Nuriawarti, F. A., Zahro, S. F., & Hardini, W. A. (2020). *Peer Dialogue as an Effective Way for Teaching Speaking: Indonesian EFL Students' Voices*. *434*(Iconelt 2019), 235–237. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200427.046

Hussein, A. (2009). The use of triangulation in social sciences research. *Journal of Comparative Social Work*, *4*(1), 106–117.

Kamin, C. S., O'Sullivan, P. S., Younger, M., & Deterding, R. (2001). Measuring critical thinking in problem-based learning discourse. *Teaching and Learning in Medicine*, *13*(1), 27–35.

Kawulich, B. (2012). Collecting data through observation. *Doing Social Research: A Global Context*, *6*(12), 150–160.

Kumar, R., & Refaei, B. (2017). Problem-based learning pedagogy fosters students' critical thinking about writing. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Problem-Based Learning*, *11*(2).

Kumaro, M., & Barliana, M. S. (2022). Integration of 4Cs Skills into Learning by Using the Project Based Learning (PjBL) Model to Face the Challenges of the 21st Century. *4th International Conference on Innovation in Engineering and Vocational Education (ICIEVE 2021)*, 88–93.

Lin, L.-F. (2017). Impacts of the Problem-Based Learning Pedagogy on English Learners' Reading Comprehension, Strategy Use, and Active Learning Attitudes. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, *5*(6), 109–125.

Nadiah, Arina, & Ikhrom. (2019). The Students' Self-Confidence in Public Speaking. *ELITE Journal*, *1*(1), 1–11. https://www.elitejournal.org/index.php/ELITE

Nganga, L. (2019). Preservice teachers' perceptions and preparedness to teach for global mindedness and social justice using collaboration, critical thinking, creativity and communication (4cs). *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, *10*(4), 26–57.

Nurtanto, M., Fawaid, M., & Sofyan, H. (2020). Problem based learning (PBL) in Industry 4.0: Improving learning quality through character-based literacy learning and life career skill (LL-LCS). *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1573*(1), 12006.

Palmer, C., & Bolderston, A. (2006). A brief introduction to

qualitative research. *Canadian Journal of Medical Radiation Technology*, *37*(1), 16–19.

Patton, M. Q. (1999). Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health Services Research*, *34*(5 Pt 2), 1189.

Pratama, M. A. R., Cahyono, E., & Aggraito, Y. U. (2019). Implementation of problem based learning model to measure communication skills and critical thinking skills of Junior High School Students. *Journal of Innovative Science Education*, *8*(3), 324–331.

Rapley, T. (2007). Exploring documents. *Doing Conversation, Discourse and Document Analysis*, 111–124.

Rochmawati, A., Wiyanto, W., & Ridlo, S. (2019). Analysis of 21st Century Skills of Student on Implementation Project Based Learning and Problem Posing Models in Science Learning. *Journal of Primary Education*, *8*(4), 58–67.

Rusdin, N. M., & Ali, S. R. (2019). Practice of Fostering 4Cs Skills in Teaching and Learning. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, *9*(6), 1021–1035. https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v9-i6/6063

Saleh, S. E. (2019). *4Cs in the EFL Classroom*.

Savery, J. R. (2015). Overview of problem-based learning: Definitions and distinctions. *Essential Readings in Problem-Based Learning: Exploring and Extending the Legacy of Howard S. Barrows*, *9*(2), 5–15.

Scientia, J., Nawawi, M., Laili, M., & Christanti, A. (2022). Analysis of Students' 4C Skills Based on the Pedagogy Multiliteracies Model. *Jurnal Scientia*, *10*(2), 233–241.

http://seaninstitute.org/infor/index.php/pendidikan/article/view/289

Seruni, R., Munawaroh, S., Kurniadewi, F., & Nurjayadi, M. (2020). Implementation of e-module flip PDF professional to improve students' critical thinking skills through problem based learning. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1521*(4), 1–6. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1521/4/042085

Steinemann, A. (2003). Implementing sustainable development through problem-based learning: Pedagogy and practice. *Journal of Professional Issues in Engineering Education and Practice*, *129*(4), 216–224.

Stolaki, A., & Economides, A. A. (2018). The Creativity Challenge Game: An educational intervention for creativity enhancement with the integration of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs). *Computers and Education*, *123*, 195–211. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2018.05.009

Syahril, Purwantono, Wulansari, R. E., Nabawi, R. A., Safitri, D., & Kiong, T. T. (2022). The Effectiveness of Project-Based Learning On 4Cs Skills of Vocational Students in Higher Education. *Journal of Technical Education and Training*, *14*(3), 29–37. https://doi.org/10.30880/jtet.2022.14.03.003

Trilling, B., & Fadel, C. (2009). *21st century skills: Learning for life in our times*. John Wiley & Sons.

Wahyuddin, W., Ernawati, E., Satriani, S., & Nursakiah, N. (2022). The Application of Collaborative Learning Model to Improve Student's 4cs Skills. *Anatolian Journal of Education*, *7*(1), 93–102. https://doi.org/10.29333/aje.2022.718a

Walker, A., & Leary, H. (2009). A problem based learning meta

analysis: Differences across problem types, implementation types, disciplines, and assessment levels. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Problem-Based Learning*, *3*(1), 6.

Widiawati, L., Joyoatmojo, S., & Sudiyanto, S. (2018). Higher order thinking skills as effect of problem based learning in the 21st century learning. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, *5*(3), 96–105.